

# CSE373: Data Structures \& Algorithms 

## Lecture 24: The P vs. NP question, NP-Completeness

Nicki Dell

Spring 2014

## Admin

- Homework 5 due TONIGHT at 11 pm!
- Homework 6 is posted
- Due one week from today, June $4^{\text {th }}$ at 11 pm
- No partners


## The \$1M question

The Clay Mathematics Institute Millenium Prize Problems

1. Birch and Swinnerton-Dyer Conjecture
2. Hodge Conjecture
3. Navier-Stokes Equations
4. P vs NP
5. Poincaré Conjecture
6. Riemann Hypothesis
7. Yang-Mills Theory

## The P versus NP problem

Is one of the biggest open problems in computer science (and mathematics) today

It's currently unknown whether there exist polynomial time algorithms for NP-complete problems

- That is, does $P=N P$ ?
- People generally believe $P \neq N P$, but no proof yet

But what is the P-NP problem?

## Sudoku

| 2 |  |  | 3 |  | 8 |  | 5 |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  |  | 3 |  | 4 | 5 | 9 | 8 |  |
|  |  | 8 |  |  | 9 | 7 | 3 | 4 |
| 6 |  | 7 |  | 9 |  |  |  |  |
| 9 | 8 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 7 |
|  |  |  |  | 5 |  | 6 |  | 9 |
| 3 | 1 | 9 | 7 |  |  | 2 |  |  |
|  | 4 | 6 | 5 | 2 |  | 8 |  |  |
|  | 2 |  | 9 |  | 3 |  |  | 1 |

$3 \times 3 \times 3$

## Sudoku

| $\mathbf{2}$ | 9 | 4 | $\mathbf{3}$ | 7 | 8 | 1 | 5 | 6 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 1 | 7 | 3 | 6 | $\mathbf{4}$ | 5 | 9 | 8 | 2 |
| 5 | 6 | 8 | 2 | 1 | 9 | 7 | 3 | 4 |
| 6 | 5 | 7 | 1 | 9 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 8 |
| 9 | 8 | 2 | 4 | 3 | 6 | 5 | 1 | 7 |
| 4 | 3 | 1 | 8 | 5 | 7 | 6 | 2 | 9 |
| 3 | 1 | 9 | 7 | 8 | 4 | 2 | 6 | 5 |
| 7 | 4 | 6 | 5 | 2 | 1 | 8 | 9 | 3 |
| 8 | 2 | 5 | 9 | 6 | 3 | 4 | 7 | 1 |

$3 \times 3 \times 3$

## Sudoku

|  | F |  | 2 |  |  |  |  |  | 6 |  |  | C | B | 3 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | C |  |  |  | 4 | 8 | E | A |  |  | 0 |  | D |  |  |
| D | A | 8 |  |  | 3 |  | 2 | 7 | F |  |  | 6 |  | 5 |  |
| 6 |  |  | E | D | F |  | C |  | 8 |  |  |  |  |  | 7 |
|  | 9 | 3 |  | 7 |  |  |  |  | A |  |  |  |  |  | 2 |
| E |  |  |  |  |  | 6 | F | 5 |  | 8 | 4 |  | 3 |  | 1 |
| C | 8 |  | 1 | 3 | 9 | D |  | 0 | 2 |  | E |  |  |  |  |
|  | D |  | 6 |  | 5 | E | B |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 0 | 4 |
| 9 | 6 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | F | 3 | 2 |  | 0 |  | A |  |
|  |  |  |  | 4 |  | A | 8 |  | D | 0 | 9 | B |  | 2 | 5 |
| 2 |  | A |  | 0 | D |  | 5 | 6 | C |  |  |  |  |  | F |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  | 2 |  |  |  |  | A |  | 4 | 8 |  |
| B |  |  |  |  |  | 4 |  | 1 |  | A | 2 | F |  |  | 0 |
|  | 0 |  | 7 |  |  | F | 3 | C |  | D |  |  | 2 | 9 | B |
|  |  | 5 |  | 1 |  |  | A | 9 | 0 | B |  |  |  | D |  |
|  | 2 | D | A |  |  | 9 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 4 |  |

## Sudoku

| 0 | F | 9 | 2 | A | 7 | 5 | 1 | 4 | 6 | E | D | C | B | 3 | 8 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 7 | C | 1 | 3 | 6 | 4 | 8 | E | A | B | 5 | 0 | 2 | D | F | 9 |
| D | A | 8 | 4 | 9 | 3 | B | 2 | 7 | F | C | 1 | 6 | 0 | 5 | E |
| 6 | 5 | B | E | D | F | 0 | C | 2 | 8 | 9 | 3 | 4 | A | 1 | 7 |
| 4 | 9 | 3 | 5 | 7 | 1 | C | 0 | D | A | F | B | 8 | E | 6 | 2 |
| E | B | 7 | 0 | 2 | A | 6 | F | 5 | 9 | 8 | 4 | D | 3 | C | 1 |
| C | 8 | F | 1 | 3 | 9 | D | 4 | 0 | 2 | 6 | E | 5 | 7 | B | A |
| A | D | 2 | 6 | 8 | 5 | E | B | 3 | 1 | 7 | C | 9 | F | 0 | 4 |
| 9 | 6 | 4 | 8 | E | B | 1 | 7 | F | 3 | 2 | 5 | 0 | C | A | D |
| 3 | 7 | C | F | 4 | 6 | A | 8 | E | D | 0 | 9 | B | 1 | 2 | 5 |
| 2 | 1 | A | B | 0 | D | 3 | 5 | 6 | C | 4 | 8 | 7 | 9 | E | F |
| 5 | E | 0 | D | F | C | 2 | 9 | B | 7 | 1 | A | 3 | 4 | 8 | 6 |
| B | 3 | 6 | 9 | C | E | 4 | D | 1 | 5 | A | 2 | F | 8 | 7 | 0 |
| 1 | 0 | E | 7 | 5 | 8 | F | 3 | C | 4 | D | 6 | A | 2 | 9 | B |
| 8 | 4 | 5 | C | 1 | 2 | 7 | A | 9 | 0 | B | F | E | 6 | D | 3 |
| F | 2 | D | A | B | 0 | 9 | 6 | 8 | E | 3 | 7 | 1 | 5 | 4 | C |


| 2 |  |  | 3 |  | 8 |  | 5 |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  |  | 3 |  | 4 | 5 | 9 | 8 |  |
|  |  | 8 |  |  | 9 | 7 | 3 | 4 |
| 6 |  | 7 |  | 9 |  |  |  |  |
| 9 | 8 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 7 |
|  |  |  |  | 5 |  | 6 |  | 9 |
| 3 | 1 | 9 | 7 |  |  | 2 |  |  |
|  | 4 | 6 | 5 | 2 |  | 8 |  |  |
|  | 2 |  | 9 |  | 3 |  |  | 1 |


|  | F |  | 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 6 |  |  |  | C | B | 3 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | C |  |  |  | 4 | 48 | 8 | E | A |  |  | 0 |  |  | D |  |  |
| D | A | 8 |  |  |  | 3 |  | 2 | 7 | F |  |  |  | 6 |  | 5 |  |
| 6 |  |  | E | D |  | F |  | C |  | 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 7 |
|  | 9 | 3 |  | 7 |  |  |  |  |  | A |  |  |  |  |  |  | 2 |
| E |  |  |  |  |  |  | 6 | F | 5 |  | 8 | 4 |  |  | 3 |  | 1 |
| C | 8 |  | 1 | 3 |  |  | D |  | 0 | 2 |  |  | E |  |  |  |  |
|  | D |  | 6 |  |  |  | E | B |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 0 | 4 |
| 9 | 6 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | F | 3 | 2 |  |  | 0 |  | A |  |
|  |  |  |  | 4 |  |  | A | 8 |  | D | 0 | 9 | 9 | B |  | 2 | 5 |
| 2 |  | A |  | 0 |  | D |  | 5 | 6 | C |  |  |  |  |  |  | F |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 2 |  |  |  |  |  | A |  | 4 | 8 |  |
| B |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 |  | 1 | 1 | A | A 2 | 2 | F |  |  | 0 |
|  | 0 |  | 7 |  |  |  | F | 3 | C |  | D |  |  |  | 2 | 9 | B |
|  |  | 5 |  | 1 |  |  |  | A | 9 | 0 | B |  |  |  |  | D |  |
|  | 2 | D | A |  |  |  | 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 4 |  |

- 

n X n

## Sudoku

Suppose you have an algorithm $\mathrm{S}(\mathrm{n})$ to solve $\mathrm{n} \times \mathrm{n} \times \mathrm{n}$
$V(n)$ time to verify the solution
Fact: $V(n)=O\left(n^{2} \times n^{2}\right)$
Question: is there some constant such that

$$
\mathrm{S}(\mathrm{n})=\mathrm{O}\left(\mathrm{n}^{\text {constant }}\right) ?
$$

| 2 |  |  | 3 |  | 8 |  | 5 |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  |  | 3 |  | 4 | 5 | 9 | 8 |  |
|  |  | 8 |  |  | 9 | 7 | 3 | 4 |
| 6 |  | 7 |  | 9 |  |  |  |  |
| 9 | 8 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 7 |
|  |  |  |  | 5 |  | 6 |  | 9 |
| 3 | 1 | 9 | 7 |  |  | 2 |  |  |
|  | 4 | 6 | 5 | 2 |  | 8 |  |  |
|  | 2 |  | 9 |  | 3 |  |  | 1 |

## Sudoku

# P vs NP problem 

## $=$

Does there exist an algorithm for solving $n \times n \times n$ Sudoku that runs in time $p(n)$ for some polynomial $p()$ ?

## The P versus NP problem (informally)

Is finding an answer to a problem much more difficult than verifying an answer to a problem?

## Hamilton Cycle

Given a graph $G=(V, E)$, is there a cycle that visits all the nodes exactly once?

YES if $G$ has a Hamilton cycle NO if $G$ has no Hamilton cycle

The Set "HAM"
 HAM $=\{$ graph $G \mid G$ has a Hamilton cycle $\}$

## Circuit-Satisfiability

Input: A circuit C with one output
Output: YES if C is satisfiable
NO if C is not satisfiable

## The Set "SAT"

SAT $=\{$ all satisfiable circuits $C$ \}

## Sudoku

Input: $\mathrm{n} \times \mathrm{n} \times \mathrm{n}$ sudoku instance
Output: YES if this sudoku has a solution NO if it does not

## The Set "SUDOKU"

SUDOKU $=\{$ All solvable sudoku instances $\}$

## Polynomial Time and The Class "P"

## What is an efficient algorithm?

Is an $O(n)$ algorithm efficient?
How about $O(n \log n)$ ?
$\mathrm{O}\left(\mathrm{n}^{2}\right)$ ?
$\mathrm{O}\left(\mathrm{n}^{10}\right)$ ?
polynomial time
$\mathrm{O}\left(\mathrm{n}^{\mathrm{c}}\right)$ for some constant c
$O\left(n^{\log n}\right) ?$
$O\left(2^{n}\right) ?$
$\mathrm{O}(\mathrm{n}!)$ ?

## What is an efficient algorithm?

Does an algorithm running in $\mathrm{O}\left(\mathrm{n}^{100}\right)$ time count as efficient?

Asking for a poly-time algorithm for a problem sets a (very) low bar when asking for efficient algorithms.

We consider non-polynomial time algorithms to be inefficient.

And hence a necessary condition for an algorithm to be efficient is that it should run in poly-time.

## The Class P

The class of all sets that can be verified in polynomial time.

## AND

The class of all decision problems that can be decided in polynomial time.


# The question is: can we achieve even this for 

HAM?<br>SAT?<br>Sudoku?

## Onto the new class, NP

## (Nondeterministic Polynomial Time)

## Verifying Membership

Is there a short "proof" I can give you to verify that:
$G \in H A M ?$
$G \in$ Sudoku?
$G \in S A T ?$

Yes: I can just give you the cycle, solution, circuit

## The Class NP

The class of sets for which there exist "short" proofs of membership (of polynomial length) that can "quickly" verified (in polynomial time).

Fact: $\mathrm{P} \subseteq \mathrm{NP}$

Recall: The algorithm doesn't have to find the proof; it just needs to be able to verify that it is a "correct" proof.

## $P \subseteq N P$



## Summary: P versus NP

NP: "proof of membership" in a set can be verified in polynomial time.

P: in NP (membership verified in polynomial time)
AND membership in a set can be decided in polynomial time.

Fact: $\mathrm{P} \subseteq \mathrm{NP}$
Question: Does NP $\subseteq P$ ?
i.e. Does $P=N P$ ?

People generally believe $P \neq N P$, but no proof yet

## Why Care?

## NP Contains Lots of Problems We Don't Know to be in P

Classroom Scheduling
Packing objects into bins
Scheduling jobs on machines
Finding cheap tours visiting a subset of cities
Finding good packet routings in networks
Decryption

OK, OK, I care...

## How could we prove that NP = P?

We would have to show that every set in NP has a polynomial time algorithm...

How do I do that?
It may take a long time!
Also, what if I forgot one of the sets in NP?

## How could we prove that NP = P?

We can describe just one problem Lin NP, such that if this problem $L$ is in $P$, then $N P \subseteq P$.

It is a problem that can capture all other problems in NP.
The "Hardest" Set in NP
We call these problems NP-complete

## Theorem [Cook/Levin]

SAT is one problem in NP, such that if we can show SAT is in $P$, then we have shown $N P=P$.

SAT is a problem in NP that can capture all other languages in NP.

We say SAT is NP-complete.

## Poly-time reducible to each other



## NP-complete: The "Hardest" problems in NP

## Sudoku Clique

SAT
Independent-Set

## 3-Colorability HAM

These problems are all "polynomial-time equivalent" i.e., each of these can be reduced to any of the others in polynomial time

If you get a polynomial-time algorithm for one, you get a polynomial-time algorithm for ALL.
(you get millions of dollars, you solve decryption, ... etc.)

